1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	ROBERT C. SCHUBERT (SBN 62684) WILLEM F. JONCKHEER (SBN 178748) SCHUBERT JONCKHEER & KOLBE LLP Three Embarcadero Center, Suite 1650 San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone: (415) 788-4220 rschubert@schubertlawfirm.com wjonckheer@schubertlawfirm.com BRIAN J. WANCA (admitted pro hac vice) GLENN L. HARA (admitted pro hac vice) RYAN M. KELLY (admitted pro hac vice) ROSS M. GOOD (admitted pro hac vice) ANDERSON & WANCA 3701 Algonquin Road, Suite 500 Rolling Meadows, IL 60008 Telephone: (847) 368-1500 bwanca@andersonwanca.com ghara@andersonwanca.com rkelly@andersonwanca.com rgood@andersonwanca.com	
12	Attorneys for Plaintiffs	
13	[Additional Counsel on Signature Page]	
14	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
15	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA OAKLAND DIVISION	
16	O. 1112. 11 (2)	1
17 18 19	TRUE HEALTH CHIROPRACTIC INC., and MCLAUGHLIN CHIROPRACTIC ASSOCIATES, INC., individually and as the representatives of a class of similarly-situated persons,	Case No. 4:13-cv-02219-HSG (DMR) PLAINTIFFS' STATEMENT OF ELEMENTS OF LIABILITY FOR PLAINTIFFS' INDIVIDUAL TCPA CLAIMS
20	Plaintiffs,	Pretrial Conference: January 10, 2022
21	v.	Time: 10:00 a.m.
22	MCKESSON CORPORATION, MCKESSON TECHNOLOGIES, INC.,	Courtroom: 2, 4th Floor Judge: Haywood S. Gilliam, Jr.
23	and DOES 1-10,	
24	Defendants.	
25		J
26		
27		
28		
	PLAINTIFFS' STATEMENT OF ELEMENTS OF LIABILITY FOR PI	AINTHEES' INDIVIDUAL TODA CLAIMS

CASE No. 4:13-CV-02219-HSG (DMR)

1 In compliance with the Court's Order (Doc. 509), Plaintiffs McLaughlin Chiropractic 2 Associates, Inc. and True Health Chiropractic, Inc. state as follows: 3 There are three elements of liability for each of the Plaintiffs' individual claims under the 4 Telephone Consumer Protection Act of 1991 ("TCPA"), 47 U.S.C. § 227, and a fourth element to 5 establish treble damages: 6 ELEMENT ONE: Plaintiffs have the burden to prove that each Defendant is a "sender" of 7 the Faxes¹ sent to Plaintiffs. A "sender" is defined as "the person or entity on whose behalf a 8 facsimile unsolicited advertisement is sent or whose goods or services are advertised or promoted 9 in the unsolicited advertisement." 47 C.F.R. § 64.1200(f)(11). 10 ELEMENT TWO: Plaintiffs have the burden to prove that the Faxes are "advertisements." 11 An "advertisement" is defined as "any material advertising the commercial availability or quality 12 of any property, goods, or services." 47 C.F.R. § 64.1200(f)(1); 47 U.S.C. § 227(a)(5). 13 ELEMENT THREE: Plaintiffs have the burden to prove that Defendant(s) sent the Faxes 14 to a "telephone facsimile machine" by the use of a "telephone facsimile machine, computer, or 15 other device." A "telephone facsimile machine" is defined as "equipment which has the capacity 16 (A) to transcribe text or images, or both, from paper into an electronic signal and to transmit that 17 signal over a regular telephone line, or (B) to transcribe text or images (or both) from an electronic 18 signal received over a regular telephone line onto paper." 47 U.S.C. § 227(a)(3); 47 C.F.R. 19 § 64.1200(f)(14). 20 ELEMENT FOUR: Plaintiffs have the burden to prove that Defendant(s) "willfully or 21 knowingly" violated the TCPA. 47 U.S.C. § 227(b)(3)(C). A "willful" violation entails "not only 22 knowing violations of a standard, but reckless ones as well." Safeco Ins. Co. of Am. v. Burr, 551 23 U.S. 47, 56–57 (2007). 24 25 Dated: January 10, 2022 /s/ Ross M. Good By: BRIAN J. WANCA (admitted *pro hac vice*) 26 RYAN M. KELLY (admitted *pro hac vice*) 27 ¹ See Stipulation Regarding Named Plaintiffs' Individual Receipt of Faxes at Issue (Doc. 491) at 2. 28

Plaintiffs' Statement of Elements of Liability For Plaintiffs' Individual TCPA Claims Case No. 4:13-cv-02219-HSG (DMR)

1

1	GLENN L. HARA (admitted pro hac vice)
2	ROSS M. GOOD (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i>) ANDERSON + WANCA
2	3701 Algonquin Road, Suite 500
3	Rolling Meadows, IL 60008
4	Telephone: 847-368-1500
5	Fax: 847-368-1501 bwanca@andersonwanca.com
	rkelly@andersonwanca.com
6	ghara@andersonwanca.com
7	rgood@andersonwanca.com
8	ROBERT C. SCHUBERT
	WILLEM F. JONCKHEER
9	SCHUBERT JONCKHEER & KOLBE LLP
10	Three Embarcadero Center, Suite 1650 San Francisco, CA 94111
11	Telephone: 415-788-4220
11	Fax: 415-788-0161
12	rschubert@schubertlawfirm.com
13	wjonckheer@schubertlawfirm.com
14	GEORGE D. JONSON (admitted pro hac vice)
	MATTHEW E. STUBBS (admitted pro hac vice)
15	MONTGOMERY JONSON LLP 600 Vine Street, Suite 2650
16	Cincinnati, OH 45202
17	Telephone: 513-241-4722
1 /	Fax: 513-768-9220 gjonson@mojolaw.com
18	mstubbs@mojolaw.com
19	
20	Attorneys for Plaintiffs
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	